A qualitative evaluation of a proposed new metro map for Melbourne

William Cartwright
Proposed new map for Melbourne’s rail network

presentation
Proposed new map for Melbourne’s rail network

Public Transport Victoria

presentation
Proposed new map for Melbourne’s rail network

New design wrt Beck’s LUG map

Public Transport Victoria

presentation
presentation

- Proposed new map for Melbourne’s rail network
- Public Transport Victoria
- New design wrt Beck’s LUG map
- Beck’s ‘rules’
presentation

- Proposed new map for Melbourne’s rail network
- Public Transport Victoria
- New design wrt Beck’s LUG map
- Improvement?
- Beck’s ‘rules’
presentation

- Proposed new map for Melbourne’s rail network
- Public Transport Victoria
- New design wrt Beck’s LUG map
- Beck’s ‘rules’
- ‘going around in circles’?
- improvement?
Melbourne’s rail system
• Commuter rail model
  – Centered on the CBD
  – Main commuter rail station - Flinders Street Station
  – 16 electrified lines
  – Central City loop (underground)
  – 207 stations
  – 372 km of electrified lines
Development
• 1853
  – Melbourne to Hobson’s Bay Railway Company formed in 1853

• 1854
  – First railway line in Australia
    • Flinders Street Station to Sandridge (now Port Melbourne)
• 1853
  – Melbourne to Hobson’s Bay Railway Company formed in 1853

• 1854
  – First railway line in Australia
    • Flinders Street Station to Sandridge (now Port Melbourne)
1853
- Melbourne to Hobson’s Bay Railway
  Company formed in 1853

1854
- First railway line in Australia
  - Flinders Street Station to Sandridge (now Port Melbourne)

1859
- Williamstown railway line
  - Connecting Williamstown and Geelong to the new Spencer Street station
Expanding the network
• 1880
  – ‘Land Boom’ in Victoria
• Lines developed further from the centre
• Electrification
Melbourne 1902
Sandringham Station at the Official Opening, 10th March, 1919.  

Melrose Street, Sandringham opposite railway station c1920  
Boom and bust
Victorian Railways
Outer circle closes 1897
Inner circle closes 1948

http://3.bp.blogspot.com/-0IAL6v3oUTQ/Uvv4UHv9T5I/AAAAAAAAC6A/GoWvUJXc0hg/s1600/inner+outerCityCircle.jpg
Mapping Melbourne’s metropolitan rail system
Melbourne suburban rail system. Victorian Railways, Melbourne : Railway Dept. 1884
Source: SLV
Railways & tramways map of Melbourne and suburbs, 1920.
Collins Book Depot.
Melbourne
Source: SLV
1994 - x3 fare zones
2007 - x2 fare zones
A new map for Melbourne
A new map for Melbourne
Exemplar of metropolitan rail system mapping
Sketch for London Underground map Henry C. (Harry) Beck (1903-74), 1931. Pencil and coloured ink
Beck's drawing for the map 1931
‘Beckesque’ followers
George Salomon
New York City Transit Authority (NYCTA) map, 1958
Influenced by Beck

Erik Spiekermann, Berlin U-Bahn map 2014
Spiekermann:

"My Berlin transit diagram owes a lot to Beck. … It works very well for the Tube. It never pretends to work for other types of journeys. The only reason people are using it for everything else is that it appears to be so simple, hiding the whole complexity of London underneath those few lines and angles” (The Independent, 2011).
A benchmark for evaluation
Beck’s rules

- Geography ‘above ground’ removed
  - Except Thames River
- Only horizontal, vertical or 45° lines for rail lines
- Colour coding (as per the F. H. Stingemore map of 1927)
- ‘Tickmarks’ for stations
- Symbol for interchange stations
- Centre enlarged
- Outlying extents ‘moved’ closer to the centre
Evaluation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Beck design criteria</th>
<th>Proposed new map for Melbourne</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geography ‘above ground’ removed (except for Thames River)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only horizontal, vertical or 45° lines for rail lines</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rail lines colour coded</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinctive symbols for interchange stations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre of map was enlarged for clarity</td>
<td>Centre of map not enlarged enough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outlying extents of the rail system ‘moved’ closer to the centre</td>
<td>No real compression of outlying stations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Add stylised rivers
  – Yarra
  – Maribyrnong
• Add stylised Bay
• Enlarge centre of map
• Compress outlying rail network
Going around in circles?

Verdict
Missing link

Good Cartography
Just considering ‘the map’ is not enough
Cognitive Cartography

Performance Cartography

Material Cartography / Social Construction

Cognitive Cartography
A fantasy of orderiness

“Beck’s London Underground map offered an image of organisational clarity, brilliantly presenting the increasingly chaotic city as an object of coherence”

Language Beck’s map

- Shapes the mental image of the city
- Gives prominence to lines and connections
- Focusses on the geography below ground
- Provides the connections
‘Outside’ influences on Beck: Modern consciousness of the time

Re-configuring the spirit of place, of London, around the emerging concept of the information economy.

“The city as a machine”

Machine aesthetic

Already established in the formal languages of the avant-garde

+ “The city as a machine” metaphor


http://www.blarg.net/~dr_z/Movie/Posters/Reproductions/Metropolis_Rep.html)
‘Outside influences’ and the Melbourne map
Missing links

Good Cartography + Cognitive Cartography
Thank you