Submissions received during consultation that do not wish to be heard

Public Hearing For Heritage Places (Institutions And Colleges)
Development Plan Amendment
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Submission No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1             | Andrew Humby from Department of Planning, Transport and Infrastructure | Level 5  
50 Flinders Street  
Adelaide SA 5000 |
Mr Mark Goldstone  
Chief Executive Officer  
City of Adelaide  
GPO Box 2252  
ADELAIDE SA 5001

Attention: Ms Shanti Ditter and Ms Beth Merrigan

Dear Mr Goldstone

ADELAIDE CITY COUNCIL – HERITAGE PLACES (INSTITUTIONS AND COLLEGES) NORTH ADELAIDE DEVELOPMENT PLAN AMENDMENT

Thank you for providing the Department of Planning, Transport and Infrastructure (the Department) with an opportunity to comment on the Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) North Adelaide Development Plan Amendment (DPA).

As Council is aware, the Minister for Planning, the Hon John Rau, sought preliminary expert advice from the Local Heritage Advisory Committee (LHAC) on the merits of the proposed Local Heritage listings and it recommended that additional justification be provided to support the DPA. As per the Minister’s letter of 30 March 2017, Council is reminded that it will need to provide this additional justification in lodging the DPA for approval.

Furthermore, per the Minister’s letter of 29 January 2017, Council is requested to amend the extent of listing for the six proposed Local Heritage Places located on the Kathleen Lumley site to include only the front 6 metres of the dwellings and associated verandahs.

In addition to this, Council should note that it will need to update Policy Area Maps Adel/38 and 39 to reflect the changes introduced via the recently approved North Adelaide Former Channel 9 Site DPA.

These issues will need to be resolved prior to submitting the DPA to the Minister for approval.
It is requested that Council’s response to the Department’s submission be included in
the summary of agency submissions. Should changes suggested by the Department
not be incorporated into the DPA, Council is requested to contact Nadia Gencarelli.

Please note that there may be instances where discrepancies arise between the
views of one government agency and another on certain issues. In such
instances, please contact the Department so it can assist Council in resolving
these issues (once all agency submissions have been received).

Following the consultation period, Council is required to consider submissions made
and determine whether Council wishes to proceed with the DPA, and if so any changes
that are proposed.

As noted in the Statement of Intent, government agencies must be provided with a
summary of their submission and Council’s response. In this regard, a copy of the
relevant excerpt from the submission summary table would be appropriate. Further, if
Council intends to make the agency’s comments publicly available, Council should
seek each agency’s approval in writing, prior to release.

Transition to the Planning and Design Code

Notwithstanding the above, as you are aware the passing of the Planning,
Development and Infrastructure Act 2016 provides for the introduction of the Planning
and Design Code (the Code). The Code is intended to provide a consistent and
contemporary planning policy framework across the State. With this in mind, Council
should be aware that any policy affected by the DPA will need to be revisited as part
of the transition to the Code.

Approval Package

The approval package to the Minister should consist of the following documents:

- a covering letter
- the Amendment
- summary of Consultation and Proposed Amendments Report
- summary and response to agency submissions
- hard copy of all submissions
- a copy of the amendment instructions in track changes showing the changes
  made in response to consultation.

More information on the documents that are required to be submitted at the final
approval stage can be found at the following web address:


The information can then be accessed by referring to the Practitioners Guide to
Preparing Development Plan Amendments PDF document and by accessing the
templates and guides hyperlink.
Please also note that, prior to submitting the final approval package to the Minister, you should submit all maps in Adobe Illustrator format and a copy of the Amendment Instructions to the DPA Mapping Coordinator (email: DPTI.PDDPAMappingCoordinator@sa.gov.au). Authorised PDF maps will be returned to Council to submit as part of the approval package to the Minister.

Council is also required to ensure that the Local Member of Parliament has been consulted on the DPA. If the Local MP changes following consultation, a copy of the approval DPA should be forward to the current MP for comment, prior to lodging the final approval package.

**Hand-over meeting**

The Department encourages Council and/or Consultant to arrange a meeting with the relevant Planning Officer to discuss and hand over the approval package. This will ensure all documentation is included in the package and provides Council the opportunity to discuss the key issues arising out of the process.

If you have any questions on this matter, please contact Nadia Gencarelli by phone on 7109 7036 or email at nadia.gencarelli@sa.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

Andrew Humby
**UNIT MANAGER – DEVELOPMENT PLANS**
**DEVELOPMENT DIVISION**
**DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, TRANSPORT AND INFRASTRUCTURE**

2/8/2017
## PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Submission No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>John Bridgland</td>
<td>5/274 Ward Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>North Adelaide SA 5006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Professor Norman Etherington from National Trust of SA</td>
<td>PO Box 787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>North Adelaide SA 5066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Geoff and Jasmine Goode</td>
<td>2 Steuart Place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>North Adelaide SA 5006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Rose Alwyn from St Marks College</td>
<td>46 Pennington Terrace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>North Adelaide SA 5006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Sharon Mosler</td>
<td>4A/39 Jeffcott Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>North Adelaide SA 5006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
And general comment all sites.

Submission Form

Submissions close 5pm, Wednesday 2 August 2017

It is Council’s policy that for a formal submission to be received it must include your name and residential address. Formal submissions will be provided to Council and will be a publicly available document. Mandatory information is marked with an *asterix

* First Name: JAN
* Surname: BRIDGLAND

* Address: 5/274 WARD ST, NORTH ADELAIDE

E-Mail

Please indicate if you want to be heard at a Public Hearing at 5.30pm on Thursday 10 August 2017 at the Adelaide Town Hall:

☐ Yes ☑ No

Please tell us how you participate in city life (tick all that apply):

☐ Work ☑ Live ☐ Shop ☑ Play (e.g. Leisure, recreation, entertainment, dining)

☐ Study ☐ Tourist ☑ Own a Business

Please provide your feedback regarding the Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) North Adelaide DPA.

Council would like to know:

- Why these buildings are important to the local area?
- Do you have any additional historical information you can provide about the buildings and the area’s development?
- Do you have any comments on the extent of the listing of the Kathleen Lumley cottages on Finnis Street, noting that:
  - the Minister’s approach: list the front 6m of each dwelling and associated verandah (approx. 1 room)
  - Council’s approach: list ‘two rooms’ depth

Comments

I support the listing of these places. (All four sites.)

In relation to the extent of the listing of the Kathleen Lumley cottages (Minister – only one room; Council – two rooms’ depth) – I don’t support either proposition. This is ‘facadism’ and disrespects the notion of conservation of the whole of
the place. Were this ridiculous political/developmental compromise to be applied across the whole of the Historic (Conservation) Zone (HCZ), North Adelaide would see the progressive demolition of substantial numbers of local heritage listed places, leaving only facades, behind which at-odds built forms of a contemporary style would begin to appear.

This would have the long-term effect of destroying a fundamental aspect of the HCZ adopted only 11 years ago.

The institutions’ resistance to the proposal to list these places highlights an aggressive departure from their original 2006 support of the zoning and development plan framework inherent in the HCZ.

Written submissions must be received by: 5pm Wednesday 2 August 2017

DPA Consultation
Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) North Adelaide DPA
GPO Box 2252 Adelaide SA 5001

or

Alternatively, if you wish to lodge your submission electronically, please go to Council’s web page yoursay.cityofadelaide.com.au or email yoursay@cityofadelaide.com.au

Please indicate whether you wish to be heard at the public hearing.
28 June 2017

Ms. Beth Merrigan
City of Adelaide
25 Pirie Street
Adelaide SA 5000

Dear Ms. Merrigan,

Public Consultation: Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) Development Plan Amendment

This matter was considered at meeting of our Cultural Heritage Advisory Committee on 21 June 2017. This expert committee of 14 members includes architects, planners, historians, engineers, journalists and National Trust councillors; it was unanimously of the opinion that all the nominated places deserve preservation as Local Heritage. These structures are well known to us from previous studies. We would comment as follows on each of the nominations.

The cottages at 41-67 Finniss Street are important both for their intrinsic heritage values as early buildings (all constructed in the period 1870-85) when the South Australian colony was not yet 50 years old, and for their contribution to the historic streetscape in that part of North Adelaide. In accordance with the Burra Charter of IOMOS Australia their fabric should be preserved to a depth of at least 12 metres. They balance and enhance the historic ambience created by the buildings opposite on the north side of Finniss Street. They establish a scale and rhythm that we should be sorry to lose. Previous heritage studies have recommended their listing as local heritage. Regrettably the most recent nominations failed on the spurious ground advanced by a reviewer that the present perimeter fence prevents the public from appreciating their heritage character. The proper response to that objection is for Kathleen Lumley College authorities to lower the fence. As the cottages sit almost on the street frontage they cannot be said to inhibit the development of the college. Any more intense development above a height of 10 metres within 12 metres of the frontage would drastically diminish the visual amenity of the streetscape. We cannot afford to lose any North Adelaide cottages dating from before 1890. It is also worth remembering that the destruction of previous cottages on Finniss Street and Mackinnon Parade resulted in the erection of luxury townhouses which actually diminished the residential density of the area. That mistake ought not to be repeated.
The Lohe Memorial Library is important as a surviving element in the original Whinham College complex that predated the establishment of the Lutheran Seminary on this landmark corner of North Adelaide. Its historic character remains largely intact and while the classical portico added some 60 years ago compromised the fabric, it contributes an additional visual dignity to the building, appropriate to its present use as the seminary library.

The former stables at St. Marks College deserve retention for the interpretation of the former Downer House which demonstrates a way of life that was changed but not obliterated by the development of the College. Its conversion to a chapel was a happy inspiration that over the years has come to be much appreciated by students and alumni. There are now very few former stables of such distinction surviving in the Adelaide City Council area.

The Calvary Hospital Mortuary deserves designation as Local Heritage by virtue of its unique architecture.

Sincerely,

[Signature]
Submission Form

Submissions close 5pm, Wednesday 2 August 2017

It is Council's policy that for a formal submission to be received it must include your name and residential address. Formal submissions will be provided to Council and will be a publicly available document. Mandatory information is marked with an "asterisk.

* First Name: GEOFF
  Surname: GOODF
  Address: 2 STEWART PLACE NORTH ADELAIDE
  E-Mail: geoffgoode@internode.on.net

Please indicate if you want to be heard at a Public Hearing at 5.30pm on Thursday 10 August 2017 at the Adelaide Town Hall:

- Yes
- No

Please provide your feedback regarding the Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) North Adelaide DPA.

Feedback that Council would like to know includes:

- Why are these buildings important to the local area?
- Do you have any additional historical information you can provide about the buildings and the area's development?
- Do you have any comments on the extent of the listing of the Kathleen Lumley cottages on Finnis Street, noting that:
  - the Minister's approach: list the front 6m of each dwelling and associated verandah (approx. 1 room)
  - Council's approach: list "two rooms" depth
- Or any other comments.

Comments:

1. Retention of North Adelaide's heritage and character requires these buildings to be heritage listed and preserved.

2. Two room depth between street frontage and the up to four story height would seem essential to keep the appearance of Finnis Street (south) intact.

[Signature]

[Handwritten Notes]
2nd August 2017

Ms Beth Merrigan
Senior Policy Advisor
Corporation of the City of Adelaide SA 5000
By Email: b.merrigan@cityofadelaide.com.au

Dear Beth

Re: Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) Interim Development Control DPA

ST MARK’S COLLEGE CHAPEL/FORMER STABLE

Introduction

The College has played an important role in maintaining heritage listed buildings and recognises the link that they provide between the present and the story of our past and takes seriously its responsibility to safeguard it for future generations. This is clearly demonstrated through its ongoing work on the four state heritage listed buildings along the Pennington Terrace frontage of the College), including current work on repairing and restoring the gutters of Downer House.

Support of the local heritage listing of the Chapel/Former Stable

St Mark’s College supports the Heritage Places (Institutions and Colleges) North Adelaide DPA and in principal, supports the local heritage listing of the chapel/former stable. In supporting the statement of heritage value, thematic history and significance, the College also seeks further consideration of the elements of heritage value and the opportunity to redevelop the space, recognising that buildings such as this play as an important link between the past and the present.

History of the Chapel/Former Stable

The attached appendix is a scan from the book by Gavin Walkley (Walkley G (1985) St Mark’s College – The Buildings and Grounds Lutheran Publishing House) that pertains to the Chapel/Former Stable.
Future use and adaptation of the Chapel/Former Stable

The College believes that at some stage into the future, some adaptation of the building will give it a new lease of life. The existing space is small and has little natural light. It can only accommodate few numbers for small gatherings and services, with the overflow of guests usually seated outside the front door on the brick paving under a portable marquis.

Any new design would be compatible with the building, retain its historic character and conserve significant fabric. An expansion of a lightweight structure from the western wall (e.g., glass and steel) would ensure that the original bluestone façade on the eastern side and wings on the northern and southern side would remain. This structure would complement the building, improve functionality, enable more people to access and enjoy the feel of the building, improved natural light and stunning views of the recently constructed walled garden to the west (former at grade bitumen car park).

Sensitive renovation to this small building would also significantly enhance its use and amenity and the area around the building. Further work to this building will not only conserve what is important about it, but provide an opportunity to reveal and interpret its history whilst also providing sustainable long term uses.

We believe that heritage protection should not be seen as a permanent barrier to change, rather to ensure that change is positive and responds sensitively to the special interest of the historic environment and the use of the College, its students and the wider College community and neighbours into the future, demonstrating how each generation is able to contribute to the constantly evolving historic environment in its own ways.

FURTHER COMMENTS

Master Planning

St Mark’s has been consulting openly and clearly with Council regarding its Master Planning since 1992. Over time, the College has developed excellent relationships with key experts in areas of heritage, architecture, town planning and Council to ensure that future developments not only enhance the College but are sensitive to, and consider the surrounding historical precinct.

The College’s Master Plan is reviewed on a regular basis so that future buildings and infrastructure reflect the changing needs of the modern students and building code requirements. The College is currently reviewing its plan following the completion of the East Wing and Car Park in 2015, and will provide Council with a copy once complete.
To ensure the preservation of the four, state heritage listed buildings on the Pennington Terrace frontage, opportunities to develop other areas of the College is important.

The North Adelaide Large Institutions DPA

The College wishes to make the following brief remarks in relation to the further amendments to the North Adelaide Large Institutions and DPA, particularly reducing the maximum building height of the north eastern corner of the College site from 4 storeys to 3 storeys and that this portion of the site to incorporate non-complying controls for building heights greater than three stories.

- Those buildings that are internal to the College (ie Newland and East Wing) to be increased from three stories to four/five stories based on merit. The new building has been designed and built so that a further two stories can be added.
- Newland building will be difficult on the current footprint as any renovations will result in the number of rooms being reduced. The Newland footprint, increasing slightly would allow for access requirements and the height to four storeys would ensure the retention of the same number of rooms.
- The north west of the college to be developed to three storeys with the required setback to Abbot Lane.
- The existing carpark (marked A) to be allowed to five storeys.
- The carpark has been constructed to allow an additional two storeys
- The aim of the car park is to consolidate cars and car parking in one area of the College, increasing the College’s green space and the impact of students parking their cars on the street, which impacts on event car parking and people parking and using the amenities in North Adelaide and the City.
- The College has gone outside of the requirements of a private carpark to comply with the requirements of a public carpark.

Thank you for your consideration.

Yours sincerely

R S Alwyn
Master
THE CHAPEL BUILDING

IT MAY BE assumed that when Simeon Barnard built Downer House in 1876–77 he built the stables and coach house at the same time, or soon afterwards. The City Council Rate Books do not give any clues to the date of the building.

Unlike the house itself it is built of “blue-stone”, with a two-storey central part that was probably the stable with a hay loft above, and single storey wings which could have housed horse-drawn vehicles of some kind.

The earliest known use after St. Mark’s bought the Downer property was as a gymnastics. This was on the ground floor of the central part. Most of the equipment was provided by Allan Walkley, a Foundation student who had been School champion gymnast at St. Peter’s in the year before he entered St. Mark’s.

Soon after the reopening of the College at the end of the war the Council converted the spacious loft into a useful little oratory, for which Dean Jose secured furniture that the Church had provided for Air Force use.

Throughout the twenties and thirties the loft had been a favourite venue for twenty-first birthday parties and other celebrations involving the consumption of large quantities of beer. It was said at the time that for its conversion to a chapel it required a special blessing by the Bishop. The Chapel was of sufficient size for the regular Holy Communion services. In 1965 G. W. Nairn, a recent graduate in Architecture, completely renovated the Chapel and designed new furniture for it.

Mr R. B. Lewis was largely responsible for the conversion of the ground floor from a gymnasium to a library in the nineteen forties. He was able to include the handsome Mortlock shelving in blackwood which had been given by the generous philanthropist, Mrs J. T. Mortlock, in memory of her husband, who had been one of the foundation supporters of the College.

Sir Grenfell Price, in his History, says:

"... a tribute should be given to R. B. Lewis for his continuous improvement of the Library from his early days as Vice Master. The turning point, although not the conclusion of his work, came when he was able to move the Library from the ground floor of the old stable to the upper floor of the Price Building..."

The move of the Library to its permanent home occurred in 1965. The vacated space on the ground floor of the Stable Building was used as a music practice room until, in 1977, there was a further transformation.
THE CHAPEL: Interior showing the granite altar, 1985.

The Council accepted a proposal by Hugh G. B. Wilkinson, while a student in College during 1976–77, to cut away three-quarters of the floor of the loft above to produce a chapel on the ground floor which would be open to the roof, except where the remaining quarter of the floor would form a gallery to the Chapel below. The Gallery was to be accessible by steep stairs.

A plaque on the Chapel wall records the construction works carried out by Wilkinson personally and almost unaided. This included the ingenious re-use of the first floor joists which had been removed, to make the balustrade, stairs, lectern, main door, window frames and chairs.

The massive granite altar, quarried at Black Hill, near Cambrai, South Australia, was set in place by members of the College.

The Rose Window above the altar, designed and made by Cedar Prest, was given in 1979 by the Revd. Peter Osborn, in memory of his father, Professor T. G. B. Osborn, who was successively Professor of Botany in the Universities of Adelaide, Sydney and Oxford, and who was one of the Founders of St. Mark’s College.

The building’s single storey wings, which have been enclosed by modern materials, have been used at various times as store rooms, music practice rooms, tutorial rooms and bicycle sheds.
Hi Beth,

Please see below the 1 submission that has come through YSA for your project:

- Sharon Mosler, 4A/39 Jeffcott Street North Adelaide, 5006:

  Please indicate if you want to be heard at a Public Hearing at 5.30pm on Thursday 10 August 2017 at the Adelaide Town Hall: No

  Submission: I support heritage listing of all of the institutional and College buildings listed in the North Adelaide DPA. The Mortuary Building at Calvary Hospital is a charming little red brick building which adds considerable to the streetscape and the hospital collection. Lohe Hall adds to the heritage character of the Lutheran seminary, unlike the cream brick dormitory building on the site. Most of Adelaide's old stable buildings have been demolished, and I believe the remainder should be retained, particularly the one at St Mark's College, as remnants of Adelaide's 19th century lifestyle, something for the student residents to ponder. The Kathleen Lumley College cottages in Finniss Street are diminishing remnants of Victorian houses in that part of North Adelaide. I support heritage listing of the entirety of those buildings.

Kind regards,

Barbara